# IMPROVEMENT OF EMPLOYEE COMPETENCY THROUGH THE LEARNING DUTY PROGRAM AND SELF-LEARNING PERMITS

## Dadan wahyudi<sup>1a</sup>, Euis Salbiah<sup>1</sup>, Irma Purnamasari<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Djuanda University, Bogor, West Java, Indonesia Corresponding Author E-mail address: khaijira@gmail.com

**Abstract** In improving the quality of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) or Civil Servants (PNS) in accordance with the development of science and technology in this milineal era, employees are required to be able to develop in accordance with the needs of organizations that are also developing, so that the quality of the human resources highly highlighted, based on the Head of the State Personnel Agency Regulation No. 8 of 2013 Technical Competency is the ability of every Civil Servants (PNS) that includes knowledge, skills and work attitudes that are needed in carrying out his job duties. The Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems is one part of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry which aims to improve the quality of the Ministry's Human Resources. Thus an increase in competency among employees within the Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation covers the dimensions of Skills, Knowledge, Self-Concepts, Character and Encouragement through the study assignment program and independent study permit, which in increasing this competency can provide increased competency of employees in carry out their duties in accordance with their positions, where employees are more adept at responding, careful, fast and intelligent in carrying out their duties in accordance with applicable regulations when employees carry out tasks within the scope of the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems.

**Keywords**: Competencies; learning assignments, independent study permits.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Based on the Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 101 Year 2000 (101/2000) regarding education and training, in accordance with national demands and the rapid development of science and technology and the millennial era that are very closely related to technology, in creating good governance good human resources apparatus that are competent in accordance with the position they carry out in carrying out their institutions, in creating human resources of state civil servants who have these competencies is needed to improve the quality and quality of professionalism, devotion and loyalty to the struggle of the nation and state, the spirit of unity and unity, and the development of insight and skills of the state civil servants and Civil Servants can through the Office of Education and Training program which is one part of the overall effort to develop Civil Servants in order to improve the quality of itas and quantity of employees in terms of productivity performance.

In the embodiment of the apparatus that has reliable competence is motivated by the demands of the regulations for Civil Servants who are required to increase their competence in supporting or supporting the implementation of their duties and positions (Dixon, 2013; . For example, the large number of inefficiencies in carrying out tasks is a clear proof of competency. The State Apparatuses Page | 81

are less reliable and professional as well as lacking in moral responsibilities who tend to abuse the authority of the position they hold (Jonsen & Toulmin, 1988). Such patterns or attitudes are forms of deviant attitudes that become complex problems (Newcomb & Loeb, 1999), where these human resources have not been able to adapt or accept changes in the surrounding environment which can be said to be less accepting in the face of development of science and technology and difficult to improve the habits comfortable in carrying out their duties, seen with less acceptance of changes that are very fast and dynamic in carrying out their duties, so that the competencies of the apparatus need to be considered (Phillips, 2013).

In an effort to increase competence that is reliable at the Scope of the Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystems Employees the scope of their employees is to take part in a study assignment program and an independent study permit in increasing the competency of their employees to be more reliable in carrying out the tasks of work, the Directorate General of Conservation Natural resources and Ecosystems in desperate need of quality human resources who have the competence and good performance in order to support the process of the task-the task (Rodriguez, Patel, Bright, Gregory, & Gowing, 2002). The Learning Task Program and the Independent Study Permit are one of the ways in realizing competencies that are reliable for employees within the scope of the Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation which can be used as a determining factor in determining the success of the Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation in achieving governance organizational goals and objectives.

The purpose of this study is to determine the improvement of apparatus resource competencies, specifically the Directorate General of Natural Resources Conservation and Ecosystems through study assignment programs and study permits.

#### 2. RESEARCH METHODS

This research was conducted using quantitative research methods. Where in this method seeks to describe or describe in detail the employee competency improvement model within the scope of the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems. With the selection of quantitative descriptive designs through interview techniques, the explanatory and implicit meanings of the explanations given by the informants are explained.

In the process of collecting data using a closed questionnaire distribution using a Likert scale and informal interviews, in which questionnaires or questionnaires are only distributed according to what is needed is distributed to employees within the Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation who are carrying out a study assignment program or an independent study permit. Where in this Likert scale has a very positive and very negative gradation that can be a Likert scale table, namely:

Table 1 Likert Scale

Size	Value
Very Good	5
Good	4
Fair	3
Not Good	2
Very Not Good	1

In the questionnaire there are 13 (thirteen) questions which needs to be filled out and answered by respondents who have determined their distribution, where in determining the minimum number of respondents using the Taro Yamane formula, besides the questions contained in the questionnaire or questionnaire are tested for validity through the validity test of the data processing program, so that the validity of the questions can be measured these can be used as benchmarks in the process of increasing employee competency through a study program and an independent study permit within the scope of the Directorate General for Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems. This data processing uses the Weight Mean Score (WMS) where all variables related to the benchmarks in this research process are calculated on average by the method. Where both all variables and indicators are applied using the WMS method the results of the processing value can be measured according to the interpretation values in the interpretation table as follows:

Table 2 Interpretation Table

Scores	Criteria
4.21-5.00	Very good
3.41-4.20	Good
2.61-3.40	Enough
1.81-2.60	Not Good
1.00-1.80poor	VeryGood

Source: Methods Administrative Research,

(Sugiyono, 2004)

While processing the results of the questionnaire distributed to the respondents were processed using Weight Mean Score (WMS) formula, as follows, namely:

Information:

M = Obtaining interpretation numbers

F = Frequency of answers

X = Weighting (value scale)

E = Sum

n = Number of all respondents' answers

Wight Mean Score (WMS) can be labeled as follows, namely:

Tabel Analisis

Alternatif Jawaban	F	(x)	(Fx)	%	$\mathbf{M} = \underbrace{\mathbf{E} \ \mathbf{f}(\mathbf{x})}_{\mathbf{n}}$
Sangat Baik					
Baik					
Cukup				8 8	
Tidak Baik					
Sangat Tidak Baik				8 8	
Jumlah					
	Sangat Baik Baik Cukup Tidak Baik Sangat Tidak Baik	Sangat Baik Baik Cukup Tidak Baik Sangat Tidak Baik	Sangat Baik Baik Cukup Tidak Baik Sangat Tidak Baik	Sangat Baik Baik Cukup Tidak Baik Sangat Tidak Baik	Sangat Baik Baik Cukup Tidak Baik Sangat Tidak Baik

From the table above, we can process answers from respondents through an alternative recapitulation of answers so that we can know the average value of each variable and research indicator.

#### 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In the process of collecting data as research material, researchers collected data both secondary and primary data through data collection tools. Where researchers took a sample of 55 (fifty-five) respondents from 120 (one hundred and twenty) employees within the scope of the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems, where the sample of these people was adjusted to the Taro Yamane formula. In this study, researchers used 5 (five) variables, namely the Dimensions of Skills, Dimensions of Knowledge, Dimensions of Self Concepts, Dimensions of Nature and Dimensions of Encouragement in accordance with Tucker and Cofsk, from these dimensions there are 13 (thirteen) indicators used as benchmarks in improving employee competency through a study assignment program and an independent study permit within the scope of the Directorate General for Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems.

From the research results of Increasing Employee Competency through the Study Task Program and Independent Study Permit Scope of the Directorate General of Natural Resource Page | 84

Conservation and Ecosystems, it can be seen the average value adjusted to the method applied by the authors in this study, as follows:

#### 1.1. Dimensions of Skills.

## 1.1.1. *Indicator Ability in completing work.*

Kemampuan dalam menyelesaikan pekerjaan.

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	×	F(x)	%	$\mathbf{M} = \frac{\sum \mathbf{F}(\mathbf{x})}{\mathbf{N}}$
1	Sangat Baik	47	5	235	85%	
2	Baik	8	4	32	159%	267
3.	Cukup	0	0	0	0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Baik 0	0	0	0	0	4,85
77.7	Jumlah	.55	9	267	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of the answers to the indicators of the ability to complete the work produces a value of 4.85 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from the accuracy in completing work for example in the process of applying for study permit within 7 (seven) working days from the receipt of a recommendation from the study permit assessment team, the authorized official determines approval / rejection of the study permit application

### 1.1.2. Indicator Ability to effectively present work.

Kemampuan mempresentasikan secara efektif pekerjaan

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{N}$
1	Sangat Baik	45	5	225	82%	
2	Baik	10	4	40	18%	265
3	Culcup	0	0	0	- 0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Baik 0	0	0	0	4,82	
	Jumlah	55	9	265	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of the answer indicators the ability to effectively present the work resulted in a value of 4.82 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews it can be seen from the way of providing explanations related to job assignments given to the executors who can explain in detail related to the process of filing a learning task flow and permission to study independently.

#### 1.1.3. Indicators of Ability in negotiation

Kemampuan dalam negosiasi

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	X	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{N}$
1	Sangat Baik	37	5	185	67%	
2	Baik	18	4	72	33%	257
3	Cukup	0	0	0	0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	.0	0	10,100
5	Sangat Tidak Baik 0	0	0	0	0	4,67
	Jumlah	55	9	257	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through the questionnaire on the indicators of ability in negotiations produce a value of 4.67 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen in how to provide an understanding of the rules set to be able to guided and implemented by employees both in the process of taking the career path of employees.

## 1.2. Dimension of knowledge

## 1.2.1. Indicator Has Information in accordance with the provisions.

Memiliki informasi yang seusai dengan ketentuan

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$\mathbf{M} = \frac{\sum \mathbf{F}(\mathbf{x})}{\mathbf{N}}$
1	Sangat Baik	41	5	205	75%	11.170
2	Baik	14	4	36	25%	261
3	Culcup	0	0	0	0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Baik 0	0	0	0	0	4,74
	Jumlah	55	9	261	100	Sangat balk

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through the questionnaire on information that fits the needs produces a value of 4.74 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from such as understanding the obligations and rights in carrying out study assignments and study permits in accordance with Ministerial regulations.

#### 1.2.2. Indicators of Knowing Related Rules.

Mengetahni aturan terkait

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$\mathbf{M} = \frac{\sum \mathbf{F}(\mathbf{x})}{\mathbf{n}}$
1	Sangat Balk	40	3.	200	73%	-
2	Balk	15	4	60	27%	260
3	Cukup	.0	0	.0	0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	- 0	- 66
5	Sangat Tidak Buik	0	0	0	0	4,73
	Jumlah	55	9	260	100	Sangat baile

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through indicators knowing the rules related to work produces a value of 4.73 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from the assessment team functional officials understand the technical instructions and implementation instructions in carrying out the assessment.

#### 1.3. Dimensions of Self-Concept.

#### 1.3.1. Indicators Have a Good Attitude at Work

Memiliki sikap yang baik dalam bekerja

No.	Alternatif jawaban	F	×	F(x)	1963	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{N}$
1	Sangat Baile	43	-5	215	78%	3,702
2	Belk	12	4	48	22%	263
3	Cukup	0	0	-0	-0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	- 92
5	Sangat Tidak Baik	0	0	0	.0	4,78
	Juniah	.55	9	263	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of the answers through the questionnaire on the indicator has a good attitude at work producing a value of 4.78 where the value has the results of interpretation that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from the discipline of employees in complete tasks intelligently, carefully and quickly examine the files for the promotion of functional officials in accordance with the regulations.

## 1.3.2. Indicator Understand the ethical values at work

Mengerti akan nilai - nilai etiku dalam bekerja

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	k	F(x)	96	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{n}$
1	Sangat Baik	38	5	190	69%	
2	Baik	17	4	68	31%	258
3.	Culcup	0	0	0	0	55
4	Tidak Baik	.0	0	0	-0	222
5	Sangat Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	4,69
	Jumlah	55	9	258	100	Sangat back

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through the questionnaire on the indicator of understanding the ethical values at work produces a value of 4.69 where the value has the interpretation results that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from the employees understand the procedures in carrying out their duties, where every result of the study to be determined does not go directly to the resident official but is coordinated with his own supervisor first.

#### 1.3.3. Indicators Have a Reliable Self-Image.

Memiliki Citra Diri yang Handal

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	×	F(x)	%	$M = \sum_{i} F(x)$
1	Sangat Balk	32	5	160	585%	5.7777
2	Balk:	23	.4	92	42%	252
3	Culcup	0	0	0	0	55
4	Tidak Baik	0.	0	.0	0	
5	Sangut Tidak Baik	.0	0	.0	0	4,58
- 19	Jumlah	55	9	252	100	Sangar buile

From the results of the recapitulation of the answers through the questionnaire on indicators having a reliable self image produces a value of 4.58 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on the results of observations and interviews can be seen from the staff, organization and governance employees have a commitment high in carrying out the task of serving employees within the scope of the directorate general of natural resource and ecosystem conservation in supporting employee career development.

## 1.4. Dimensions of Properties.

#### 1.4.1. Indicators of having a Cooperative Soul in collaboration.

Memiliki jiwa kooperatif dalam bekerja

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	1	F(x)	16	$\mathbf{M} = \sum_{\mathbf{B}} \mathbf{F}(\mathbf{x})$
(1)	Sangat Baik	47	5	235	25%	
2	Baik	- 8	#	32	15%	267
3.	Cukup	0	0	0	. 0	55
4	Tirtak Baik	0	0.	. 0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Baik 0	0	0	0	4,85	
	Jumlah	55	0	367	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of the answers through the questionnaire on indicators have a cooperative spirit in working to produce a value of 4.85 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from the way to complete the work that helps each other in completing their tasks can be said to be a process from incoming letters to reviewers and outgoing mails have been running so that the possibility of scattered letters is very small because the system is well ordered in the process of carrying out its duties.

#### 1.4.2. Indicators can adapt to the work environment.

Dapat beradaptasi dengan lingkungan kerja

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{n}$
1	Sangat Baik	44	5	220	80%	264 55
2	Baik	- 11	4	44	20%	
3	Cukup	0	0	0	0	
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Balk	0	0	0	0	4,80
	Jumlah	55	9	264	100	Sangat baik

Dapat bekerjasama dalam bekerja

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{n}$
1	Sangat Baik	45	5	225	82%	265 55
2	Baik	10	4	40	18%	
3	Culcup	0	0	0	0	
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	4,82
	jumlah .	- 55	9	265	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through the questionnaire the indicators can adapt to the work environment resulting in a value of 4.80 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews it can be seen from the coordination between the subdivisions very well according to their respective tasks complete wherein in the personnel administration subdivision determines the formation of its employees in the functional administration subdivision pay attention to and determine the career patterns of its employees.

#### 1.4.3. Indicators Have a fast response.

Memiliki respon yang cepat tanggap

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	26	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{N}$
1	Sangat Baik	34	5	170	62%	<u>254</u> 55
2	Baik	21	4	84	38%	
3	Cukup	-0	0	.0	.0	
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
-5	Sangat Tidak Baik	0	0	0	- 0	4,62
	Jumlah	55	9	254	100	Sangat balk

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through the questionnaire on the indicator has a response that quickly responds to a value of 4.62 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews can be seen from the commands given by a boss to quickly prepare or present staffing data.

#### 1.5. Dimensions of Encouragement

#### 1.5.1. Indicators can work together.

Dapat beradaptasi dengan lingkungan kerja

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{n}$
1	Sangat Baik	44	5	220	80%	264 55
2	Baik	11	4	44	20%	
3	Cukup	.0	0	0	0	
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	
5	Sangat Tidak Balk	0	0	0	0	4,80
	Jumlah	55	9	264	100	Sangat baik

Dapat bekerjasana dalam bekerja

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	x	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{n}$
1	Sangat Baik	45	5	225	82%	265 55
2	Baik	10	4	40	18%	
3	Culcup	0	0	0	0	
4	Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0.	
5	Sangat Tidak Baik	0	0	0	0	4,82
	yumlah	- 55	9	265	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of answers through the questionnaire the indicators can work together to produce a value of 4.82 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews it can be seen from the functional assessment team and the functional assessment team's secretariat that are mutually sustainable where the results of the assessment are submitted to the secretariat team to recap the results of the assessment to determine its recommendations.

#### 1.5.2. Achievement Indicators at work.

Bernrestari dalam bekeria

No	Alternatif jawaban	F	X	F(x)	%	$M = \frac{\sum F(x)}{N}$
1	Sangat Baik	40	5	200	73%	260 55
2	Baik	15	4	60	27%	
3	Cukup	0	0	0.	0	
4	Tidak Balk	-0	0	0	0	
ź	Sangat Tidak Baik	-0	0	0	0	4,73
	Jumlah	55	9	260	100	Sangat baik

From the results of the recapitulation of the answers through the questionnaire on the indicators of achievement in work produced a value of 4.73 where the value has the results of interpretations that are very good criteria, based on observations and interviews, it can be seen from employees who get a service mark or a class promotion. The obstacles in the process of increasing employee competency through the study assignment program and the independent study permit are: 1) Obstacles in the learning assignment ie employees who take part in the learning assignment program prefer the location of the university closest to their residence, lack of discipline in the time frame for carrying out the task learning so that it is not in accordance with the predetermined time limit where the time determined to carry out learning tasks Strata 3 (S3) is for 3 (three) years, Strata 2 (S2) 2 (two) years and Strata 1 (S1) / Diploma IV (D-IV) which is 4 (four) years, ignoring the sanctions that have been set if it is not in accordance with the time limit of learning, the cost of education is borne by itself does not get assistance from the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems and lack of knowledge to know the regulations related to the task detailed learning; 2) Obstacles in the Independent Study Permit program, namely financial factors and workload as employees. In financial terms, employees must bear all the costs of the learning process from beginning to end (Sophia & Sarno, 2019). While the obstacle of the workload as an employee is Page | 90

the difficulty in managing time in taking the learning process by completing work assignments, employees are required to complete the work Brown (2005); Purnamasari, (Munjin, & Ratnamulyani, 2019) even though it is outside working hours and must carry out external services such as attending technical guidance which is a series of employee improvements carried out normally 2 (two) to 4 (four) working days, so they cannot participate in the learning process; 3) Solutions provided by the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems to employees who carry out study assignment programs and independent study permits, namely:

- a. Providing financial assistance even though not all employees are implementing study assignments and study permits get them, usually the assistance is given in the form of materials that are used as assistance in conducting research or the final project.
- b. Providing facilities at the research location especially the implementation of the research in the working area of the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems in accordance with the location closest to the residence that is currently studying.
- c. Provide socialization and guidance regarding the timeframe that must be taken to complete the learning program by gathering employees who are on assignment to study in a certain place.
- d. Share the workload of employees who are on independent study permits to other employees and provide motivation to immediately complete learning in accordance with the time allotted to improve the ability of human resources (Garg & Rastogi, 2006) within the scope of the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

Improvement of competency through the study assignment program and independent study permit within the scope of the directorate general of natural resource and ecosystem conservation has been carried out very well in accordance with the acquisition of an average dimension variable value of 4.74. With the highest value on the dimensions of encouragement with a value of 4.77 and the lowest on the dimension of self-concept with a value of 4.68 and the highest indicator value is the ability to complete the work and have a cooperative spirit in working with an average value of 4.85. this shows that the study assignment program and the independent study permit implemented by the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems have been very good in the effort to improve the competence of its employees. While the lowest indicator is found in having a reliable self-image that is with an average value of 4.58 because the employees do not highlight each other's strengths - each is adjusted to the main tasks of each position - this is a reflection or innate of oneself that has no effect significant in achieving organizational goals. While the obstacles in carrying out the study assignment program and independent study permit are the employees who carry out the study assignments, including lack of discipline of the employees in carrying out their obligations in learning because they feel as students are in the independent study permit program, the most prominent is the obstacles in terms of internal factors and financial costs borne by themselves, so it is

not completed within the specified time limit because there are other considerations that they think are more important. Actions or efforts taken by the Directorate General of Conservation of Natural Resources and Ecosystems continue to carry out monitoring and evaluation of the implementers who carry out a study assignment program and an independent study permit, specifically for employees who carry out study assignments are given research funding assistance provided selectively because they are not all employees get it

#### 5. REFERENCES

- Brown, K. G. (2005). A field study of employee e-learning activity and outcomes. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 16(4), 465–480.
- Dixon, D. L. (2013). Relationships among servant leadership, organizational citizenship behavior, and school climate in Alabama high schools.
- Garg, P., & Rastogi, R. (2006). New model of job design: Motivating employees' performance. *Journal of Management Development*, 25(6), 572–587.
- Jonsen, A. R., & Toulmin, S. (1988). *The abuse of casuistry: A history of moral reasoning*. Univ of California Press.
- Newcomb, M. D., & Loeb, T. B. (1999). Poor parenting as an adult problem behavior: General deviance, deviant attitudes, inadequate family support and bonding, or just bad parents? *Journal of Family Psychology*, 13(2), 175.
- Phillips, L. (2013). Human adaptation and its failures. Academic Press.
- Purnamasari, I., Munjin, R. A., & Ratnamulyani, I. A. (2019). PENATAAN SUMBER DAYA MANUSIA APARATUR DAERAH BERBASIS KOMPETENSI. *JURNAL GOVERNANSI*, 5(1), 70–78.
- Rodriguez, D., Patel, R., Bright, A., Gregory, D., & Gowing, M. K. (2002). Developing competency models to promote integrated human resource practices. *Human Resource Management:* Published in Cooperation with the School of Business Administration, The University of Michigan and in Alliance with the Society of Human Resources Management, 41(3), 309–324.
- Sophia, G., & Sarno, R. (2019). AHP-TOPSIS for analyzing job performance with factor evaluation system and process mining. *Telkomnika*, *17*(3), 1344–1351.
- Sugiyono, P. (n.d.). Dr.(2017), Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, R&D. *Cetakan Ke-25. Bandung: CV Alfabeta*.