

Acquiring And Developing Outstanding Teachers Candidate: A Comparative Study From State And Private Elementary School

Rusi Rusmiati Aliyyah, Megan Asri Humaira, Didi Mulyadi, Widyasari, Rasmitadila, Sri Wahyuni Ulfah

Abstract : This paper provides a comparative study of management of both state and private elementary schools in acquiring outstanding teachers for national teachers competition. The aim is to suggest principles that can be incorporated to improve the designing of management of finding the inputs, process and outputs consisting of teachers quality at the input process, recruitment at the process stage and the outputs at career path for the outstanding teachers. The research uses comparative study consisting of state and private schools in West Java, Jakarta, Banten and Central Java provinces. The data were gained from 5 schools in the assigned areas through interviews and documentation. In the findings, similarity and differences of recruiting, developing and competing of the outstanding teachers at state and private schools. The research found that at input and process stage both state and private schools share the same model as it is based on the guidance from the government. While at the output stage, especially for the career path, the outstanding teachers from state schools are much better in having opportunity to get a higher position while outstanding teachers from private schools, their opportunities to get higher and better position will be depending much on the policy at the assigned schools.

Index Terms: Comparative studies, outstanding teachers, competition, management.

1. INTRODUCTION

Quality education is mainly caused by the input and process which means that when the inputs of the students are greatly acceptable and accurate based on the initial high-quality admission, the outputs shall be the main aspects of education [1]. Comparing is one of the primary intellectual activities of human beings. We continuously make comparisons to understand where we stand, both about others as well as to our own past experiences. Comparative studies include studies that document, analyze, contrast, or juxtapose similarities and differences across all aspects and levels of researched topics in a broader sense [2]. Artigue and Winslow argue that comparative studies are useful in investigating similarities and differences of one construct in two different contexts [3]. In Indonesia, the state and private schools are two different entities which have different approaches in managing their stakeholders. State schools are the entities which must comply with all government regulation at all aspects while the private ones are the entities which can develop and expand the management model. We always assume that the teachers' quality state school are not better compared to those of private schools. But it is possibly that teachers' quality at state schools are much better as the competition to become state employees are very tight. Qualified teachers' categories are those able to have a warm welcome and respect their students so that there will be an understanding among them, which finally forced the students to perform the best they can [4]. To answer such a question, the ministry of Education and Culture regularly holds the competition namely National Outstanding Teachers Competition. This study is to find how national outstanding

teachers competition (as the primary construct) from State and Private schools (as two different contexts) are considered and seen from two different views, state and private schools.

This research is finding the differences between state and private schools from input, process and outputs. The input components include the outstanding teachers/preparation, teachers' quality and school infrastructures. The process components consist of the recruitment process, support systems, collaboration while the output components are career path and rewards given both from government and each institution.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Education Quality

Education quality is quality education was the right of every child [5]. It affirmed that quality was 'at the heart of education' – a fundamental determinant of enrolment, retention and achievement. Its expanded definition of quality set out the desirable characteristics of learners (healthy, motivated students), processes (competent teachers using active pedagogies), content (relevant curricula) and systems (good governance and equitable resource allocation). Although this established an agenda for achieving good education quality, it did not ascribe any relative weighting to the various dimensions identified [6]. Quality of education shall consist of four pillars namely (a) Learning to know acknowledges that learners build their knowledge daily, combining indigenous and 'external' elements. (b) Learning to do focuses on the practical application of what is learned. (c) Learning to live together addresses the critical skills for a life free from discrimination, where all have equal opportunity to develop themselves, their families and their communities. (d) Learning to emphasize the skills needed for individuals to develop their full potential [6]. While Ng states that quality education which include (a) Learners who are healthy, well-nourished and ready to participate and learn (b) Environments that are healthy, safe, protective and gender-sensitive, and provide adequate resources and facilities; (c) Content that is reflected in relevant curricula and materials. (d) Processes through which trained teachers use child-centred teaching approaches.; (e)

- Rusi Rusmiati Aliyyah, Djuanda University, Bogor, Indonesia, rusi.rusmiati@unida.ac.id
- Megan Asri Humaira, Djuanda University, Bogor, Indonesia, megan.asri@unida.ac.id
- Didi Mulyadi, STIE Pertiwi Management Faculty Bekasi, Indonesia, didi.mulyadi@pertiwi.ac.id
- Widyasari, Djuanda University, Bogor, Indonesia, widyasari@unida.ac.id
- Rasmitadila, Djuanda University, Bogor, Indonesia, rasmitadila@unida.ac.id
- Sri Wahyuni Ulfah, Djuanda University, Bogor, Indonesia, wahyuniulfah26@gmail.com

Outcomes that encompass knowledge, skills and attitudes [7]. The system approach is a term that means to do something systematically. In the educational industry, to teach systematically teachers must consider input, process and output and decide objectives, contents, methods and assessment. The inputs are the objectives and objectified contents that teachers put in while the processes are the methods of delivery of contents. Outputs are the end-product of educational inputs and process those must be assessed based on objectives [8].

2.2 Educational Inputs and Process

Economists use a conceptual framework called an education production function to model the educational process that leads to improved student outcomes. In these models, a student's educational outputs, such as test scores, are a function of the quantity and quality of a variety of school and teacher inputs. Common educational input measures include class size, per-pupil expenditure, teacher education, and teacher experience. Education policy variables specific to a particular research objective, such as incentives to raise student performance, are also included as inputs [9]. In this concept, teachers are one of the most important aspects in educational inputs in which the higher their educational background and the more experience they are the educational outputs shall be the guarantees of success. Becoming a champion teacher. A "champion" is a person who can achieve a difficult goal or overcome challenging obstacles.[10] A difficult goal for a teacher could be doing things like helping a student get a scholarship, organizing a school function or getting a better assignment[11][7].

2.3 Educational Outputs and Outcomes

In education, we look for output to determine the effectiveness of our curriculum and methods. We call this process testing or assessing[12]. In schools, teachers test often to determine grades as well. In some states, the home school law requires that families have their children assessed at designated intervals. Some say that we should not test at all. Assessing is appropriate at times, but the question is how much and how often. I do believe that we tend to elicit output more than we provide input [9]. Learning objectives should be SMART, an acronym of specific, measurable, attainable, realistic and time-bound. If objectives are identified then the outcomes, which are the results of any curriculum or pro-gramme can be pre-determined and achieved. If any part of the objective is missing from the statement, it cannot be communicated accurately and the outcome cannot be determined firmly [13] Contents as inputs should be matched with objectives i.e. it should be correlated with the objectives which are then named as objectified contents. Objectified contents should be specified in terms of cognitive, affective and psychomotor skills learning. Content overload with unrelated specific objectives is a common concern in medical education. To select content, educators have to decide the core and optional portion of a topic [8].

3 METHODOLOGY

The research used the descriptive comparative approach in which similarities and differences are compared by examining the related literature. Comparative education has been concerned with the copying of educational models [14]. Comparative studies of education help school teachers,

educators, policymakers, the broad public, and the research community to improve the quality of education by facilitating the dissemination of different useful frameworks, principles, and models across nations.[14][15] The research was carried out between May until August 2019. The respondents of this research were outstanding teachers and principles at Elementary Schools having owned the outstanding teachers in 2017 and 2018. The research schools are located in Jakarta, West Java, Banten and Semarang namely Sukasari Elementary School 03 Tangerang, Islamic Elementary School Al Izhari Jakarta, State Elementary School 3 Menteng Jakarta, State Elementary School 23 Bandung and Islamic Elementary School Al Irsyad Salatiga, Central Java.

3.1 Data collection tools

Primary sources have been examined in the research the management of outstanding teachers recruitment and development between state and private schools as primary sources. Moreover, national and international articles, book chapters and theses were examined and the information given on the official web pages was used; also, this information was presented under related themes [16][17]

3.2 Data analysis

The data of the study were analyzed with the document analysis method. First of all, the literature was reviewed to make an inference regarding what titles the comparison would be done. It was then checked whether the related documents were official, original and up-to-date sources.[2] . The data analysed are those gained from interviews and documentation [18][19]

4 RESULT

The implementation of the teacher achievement competition cannot be separated from the collaboration between educational stakeholders in the region where the teacher serves. The collaboration needs to be carried out considering the requirements to become outstanding teachers are long and complicated processes which include; first: a portfolio which contains aspects of assessment in the form of sources of education and training, professional development, management of professional organizations, relevant awards, planning and implementation of learning and assessment from superiors and supervisor. The document needs to be accompanied by evidence of the truth or accuracy and originality of the information that has been conveyed. Secondly: teacher performance evaluation and learning video where teacher performance appraisal is carried out by the head and the school supervisor while the learning video is made referring to the guidelines for making learning that is tailored to the learning plan and learning syllabus. Third: Written tests relating to pedagogic and professional competence, and educational insight. Fourth: the assessment of scientific writings in the form of classroom action research, quasi-experimental or best practice. Fifth: assessment of scientific paper presentations covering aspects of presentation, subject matter and attitude in presentations. Sixth: Assessment of exemplary and noble character by using a questionnaire filled out by the principal, five teachers (peers), and ten students from the school where the teacher is assigned.

4.1 Educational Outputs and Outcomes

Principally there are no differences between state and private schools in preparing the teachers' candidacy for joining the national outstanding teachers' competition. The below table shows that there are differences between private and state schools. Both state and private schools follow the guidelines set by the government consisting of the general and specific requirements. The general requirements are that teachers' candidates must have the following requirements.

- (a) have a minimum Bachelor Degree (Strata 1/Diploma IV)
- (b) have been a teacher both at State and Private schools
- (c) have actively involved in the learning process for at least 8 years of services
- (d) provide recommendation letters from the school principles and related parties such as District Head, Mayor, or Governor.

Whilst the specific requirements are as follows :

- (a) provide the portfolio of at least the last 3 years continuously.
- (b) Have been actively producing scientific writings related to their profession or the subjects they are teaching.
- (c) Have at least a B score on teachers' performance evaluation.
- (d) Participate in the written tests carried out by the committee.

Both requirements are those designed by the government and the schools interested in joining the competition shall adjust themselves with the set criteria well.

4.2 Process Stage

In the process stage, both state and private schools share the same model as required by the government. In the recruitment stage, for instance, both state and private schools must follow the following stages before entering the national levels consisting of sub-district level competition, mayoral and city competition and province competition stages. Once they won the assigned competition the schools and the teachers may continue to the higher levels or stages with some other different requirements of recruitments. It means that the ones winning the subdistrict competition stage can continue to the following stages until it reaches the national level. It, of course, the higher stage of the competition, the candidates or schools must then prepare more.

4.3 Output Stage

At the outputs stage, the research found that there are some significant differences between state and private schools. This paper will provide data on how the career path for those winning the outstanding national teachers competition. Some differences shall be drawn at the below table.

TABLE 1
COMPARISON OF CAREER PATH

	State School	Private School
Career Development	The winner or those participating at the National Level will have a great opportunity to become a principal in the coming years. This opportunity, of course, doesn't stand alone as there are some other related requirements to	Teachers from private schools winning or participating at the national level outstanding teacher competition are not as lucky as those from state schools. Their lucks will be determined by the policy of each foundation where the schools and

become principle but those participating at the national level will have the privilege to be a step ahead compared to those without the certificate.

teachers are assigned. If the schools are aware and think they provide good impacts on the institution will have the opportunity to get a higher position. While if the schools or the foundation think they don't have direct benefits the opportunity of the teachers to get higher position will be guaranteed.

5 DISCUSSION

5.1 Input Stage

Qualified teachers must have the characteristics which will make the students feel happy when studying or being in the classroom. There is no limit to the skills and qualities that a master teacher should have. However, a teacher will still be outstanding when he acquires certain attributes, such as humility, the skill of reflection, and patience. By maintaining humility, a teacher is willing and ready to let go of practices that prove ineffective and to try new methods regardless of who brings him the ideas. Enthusiasm to improve student understanding and teacher performance should couple with patience and respect for growth processes. A teacher must be patient with, yet nonetheless committed to, this change in his students. Also, the teacher will avoid burn-out and frustration with himself when he infuses reflection on his growth with patience [20]. Qualified teachers are those with the willingness to understand students a lot. They are also the ones that improve themselves in adjusting with the current condition of the students. Qualified teachers are not only measured by the educational background but their ability to keep changing in the changing world. In connection with general and specific requirements that must be fulfilled by outstanding teachers, it is important to have collaboration between relevant education stakeholders to help resolve the obligations of outstanding teacher candidates. The characteristics were varied but usually centered around knowledge, personality, empathy and the ability to challenge them to reach their potential [21]. To keep the outstanding teacher perform well in all areas of educational industries, the related parties need to collaborate to achieve a higher target from education. Collaboration is needed to maintain the sustainability of educational value. Sustainability is a paradigm in which the future is conceived as a balance between the environment, society and economy to develop and improve their quality of life [22]. Economists talk about education as about human capital: people investing and generating a profit, like an investment in equipment, but education is more than that. Education facilitates an awareness that change is possible, that there are other ways of organizing production as teaches the basic principles of modern science and analytical reasoning items and boosts learning ability [22]. Common educational input measures include class size, per-pupil expenditure, teacher education, and teacher experience. Education policy variables specific to a particular research objective, such as incentives to raise student performance, are also included as inputs [9]. Teachers Education and experience are becoming most of the important things in the success of education. Education inputs are the means used in an education system to achieve educational objectives, such as the number of teachers,

school facilities, teaching materials supplies and the cost and level of financial resources used for education.[23] The educational inputs are important and the policymakers need to consider the educational inputs first before determining the educational outputs. As the outputs of the education will be determined how the educational inputs are prepared and provided.

5.2 Process Stage

Teachers should seek opportunities for relevant professional development and growth outside of the campus, and principals should allocate monies for their pursuits. As a goal, principals should encourage teachers to gain additional endorsements to increase their certification, and when possible, pay for teachers to take the classes needed to attain additional licensures [24]. While others also state the need for university cooperation in the process of recruitments. Whenever possible, principals in hard-to-staff schools should solicit the cooperation of local colleges and universities to engage in early on-campus recruitment of prospective teachers[25]. Many college graduates remain undecided on their career path as late as graduation day; a proactive approach to recruitment may sway a potential employee [26]. Outstanding teachers recruitment currently is in the domain of schools management. They have full authority which teachers are proposed to join the competition. If it were possible, it might be better than the recruitment model of acquiring outstanding teachers involve universities in making the process transparent and fair.

5.3 Output Stage

Educational outputs are results or outcomes of the process of learning and teaching on the level of cognition, comprehension, and practical application. These outcomes have to be measurable.[6]. Educational output can be defined as the output of the education sector as the effect of the education on the level of students of knowledge, skills and competencies [27]. Educational outputs as the results educational inputs and process are the things that can be measured very easily. The inputs are that of the quality of the teachers.[26] If the teachers are qualified and other supporting factors are great the educational outputs shall be guaranteed well.

4 CONCLUSION

Education sustainability needs to have collaboration with parties concerning with education. Collaboration is something that we need to cope with. Collaborations that must and have been carried out by educational units include the First: Higher Education Institution to provide: (a) guidance and training in making learning plans and teacher learning videos. (b) develop the ability of teacher knowledge and competence, (c) Guidance for writing scientific papers. Second: Educational Quality Assurance Institutions to provide guidance related to (a) make a correct teacher portfolio by the standards, (b) understand aspects of teacher performance appraisal and learning video making, (c) assist teachers in writing scientific papers, (d) coach how to do a presentation of scientific papers. Third: the Regional and Central Education Office to guide supervisors and official policies in facilitating teacher infrastructure following the teacher achievement competition. It includes the budgeting policies for teacher needs in completing requirements as well as debriefing and coaching

which includes: (a) how to make a good portfolio, (b) an understanding of teacher competencies that will be measured through Teacher Competency Test (TCT) and (c) Teacher Performance Assessment (TPA), and (d) how the teacher's role models and morals are. Fourth: Central and Regional House of Representatives: to provide policies and support funds for outstanding teachers. The policy which includes the budget policy in the National and Regional Budget which will have an impact on the progress of the program of outstanding teachers at the sub-district, district/municipality and provincial levels. The budgeting policy will also provide certainty that the winners or participants of the National Outstanding Teachers Competition will have the rewards consistently. Outstanding teachers competition shall be the greatest moment for the government as a trigger to develop the quality of education as we all agree that teachers' quality is one of the factors in maintaining the quality of education. If the competition is carried out regularly the process of getting high-quality teachers will be like snowballs since every year, every district will compete and propose the best teachers in their areas. The competition will also create winning and competitive attitudes among teachers across Indonesia and if it works and spreads throughout Indonesia, the quality of education in only about the time. Outstanding teachers competition shall also be prepared well from the initial stage until the final stage which includes the policy, the support systems such as the budgeting and the final stage, such as the career path the winners or participants can achieve as the process of even becoming national participants is not easy.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors wish to thank to The Ministry of Research and Technology of Higher Education, which has funded research as a part of research grants. Thank also to the Directorate of Research and Service of Djuanda University which supported the research.

REFERENCES

- [1] L. Martin, "The Assessment of Learning Outcomes in Australia : Finding the Holy Grail," AERA Open, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1–19, 2017.
- [2] C. Gatsonis and S. C. Morton, *Methods in Comparative Effectiveness Research*. New York: CRC Press, Taylor and Francis, 2017.
- [3] F. T. Pfeffer, "Equality and quality in education. A comparative study of 19 countries," *Soc. Sci. Res.*, vol. 51, pp. 350–368, 2015.
- [4] R. R. Aliyyah, M. A. Humaira, S. W. Ulfah, and D. Mulyadi, "Outstanding Teachers : The Steps In Acquiring Them," *Int. J. Educ. Vocat. Stud.*, vol. 1, no. 5, 2019.
- [5] D. Mulyadi and U. Rosyidi, "Life Skills Education Programs ; The Bridge to the Employment of the Poors Research Data Profiles," *J. Educ. Vocat. Stud.*, vol. 1, no. 5, pp. 1–6, 2019.
- [6] UNESCO, "Understanding education quality," in *EFA Global Monitoring Report*, New York: UNESCO, 2005, pp. 27–37.
- [7] P. T. Ng, "What is quality education ? How can it be achieved ? The perspectives of school middle leaders in Singapore," 2015.
- [8] A. Salam, "Input , Process and Output : system approach in education to assure the quality and excellence in performance," *Bangladesh J. Med. Sci.*, vol. 14, no.

- January, pp. 14–16, 2015.
- [9] E. R. Eide and M. H. Showalter, "Learn more about Educational Input Student Incentives Handbooks in Economics," *Int. Encycl. Educ.*, vol. 3, 2010.
- [10] J. Liu, "Constructing resource sharing collaboration for quality public education in urban China: Case study of school alliance in Beijing," *Int. J. Educ. Dev.*, vol. 59, no. September 2017, pp. 9–19, 2018.
- [11] J. J. Jeyaraj and T. Harland, "Transforming Teaching and Learning in ELT Through Critical Pedagogy: An International Study," *J. Transform. Educ.*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 343–355, 2014.
- [12] R. J. Mislevy and G. Haertel, "Implications Of Evidence-Centered Design For Educational Testing (Technical Report 17) | SRI International," *Educ. Meas. Issues Pract.*, p. 14, 2006.
- [13] A. O. Sulaimani, P. S. A. Sarhandi, and M. H. Buledi, "Impact of CALL in-house professional development training on teachers' pedagogy: An evaluative study," *Cogent Educ.*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 1–13, 2017.
- [14] M. Bray, B. Adamson, and M. Mason, *Comparative Education Research*, 2nd ed. Londok, UK: Springer International Publishing, 2014.
- [15] A. L. Strauss, "Qualitative analysis for social scientists," 1987.
- [16] V. Milošević Zupančič, "Taxonomy of Teaching Methods and Teaching Forms for Youth in Non-Formal Education in the National Youth Council of Slovenia," *Cent. Educ. Policy Stud. J.*, vol. 8, no. 1, p. 117, 2018.
- [17] B. Bogdan and S. K. Bilken, *Quality research for education: An introduction to theory and methods*. 1992.
- [18] R. E. Stake, *Qualitative Reserach; Studying How Things Work*. United States: The Guilford Press, 2010.
- [19] R. B. Sherman, Robert M, Webb, *Qualitative Research in Education: Focus and Methods*, vol. 91. New Yok: Routledge Falmer, 2017.
- [20] F. Younus, R. A. Farooq, R. Tabassum, and P. D. Scholar, "Weaknesses in Evaluation of Teaching Practice in the Formal and Non-Formal Teacher Education Institutions," *Pakistan J. Educ. Res.*, vol. 20, no. 2, pp. 159–173, 2017.
- [21] R. Seebruck, "Teacher Quality and Student Achievement : A Multilevel Analysis of Teacher Credentialization and Student Test Scores in California High Schools," *McGill Sociol. Rev.*, vol. 5, no. July, pp. 1–18, 2015.
- [22] M. A. Camelia and V. Tatiana, "Sustainable Development of Education in Region South West," *J. Reserach Sci. Today*, pp. 211–216, 2014.
- [23] R. R. Aliyyah, Widyasari, D. Mulyadi, S. Ikhwan, and A. G. Pranansa, "Manajemen Kesiswaan Pada Sekolah Dasar," *Didaktika Tauhidi: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar*, vol. 6, no. 1 April, 2019.
- [24] B. P. D. Morrell and S. Salomone, "Impact of a Robert Noyce Scholarship on STEM Teacher Recruitment," pp. 16–22, 2010.
- [25] D. I. Sensuse and B. Purwandari, "Defining e-Portofolio Factor for Competency Certification using Fuzzy Delphi Method," *TOJET Turkish Online J. Educ. Technol.*, vol. 17, no. 2, pp. 25–33, 2018.
- [26] A. T. Torrez and W. A. Kriistonis, "The Recruitment, Retention, and Development of Quality Teachers in Hard-to-Staff Schools," *Natl. FORUM Journals*, vol. 1, no. 2, 2017.
- [27] J. Voogt and G. Knezek, "Guest editorial: Technology enhanced quality education for all - outcomes from EDUsumMIT 2015," *Educ. Technol. Soc.*, vol. 19, no. 3, pp. 1–4, 2016.