Citizens' Satisfaction With Non-Cash Food Assistance

¹Chandra Ayu Pramestidewi, ^{2*}Ismartaya, ³Yulianingsih, ⁴Yoyok Prio Utomo, ⁵Palahudin

^{1,2,3,4,5}Economic Faculty, Universitas Djuanda, Bogor, Indonesia *Corresponding Author: Email: <u>ismartaya@unida.ac.id</u>

Abstract.

This observation will analyze the level of community satisfaction with non-cash food assistance for social services in the Cibinong District area, Bogor Regency, West Java. Since the March 2020 Pandemic, the government through the Social Service has collaborated with banks (Association of State Banks) to distribute non-cash food assistance (BPNT). Assistance is channeled by distributing electronic cards such as red and white special ATMs to prosperous families from the bank to underprivileged residents who have been registered in the Bogor Regency Social Service data. Then the card is exchanged for necessities (nine staples), namely: 10 kg of rice, 1 kg of eggs, 1 chicken meat, 0.5 kg of vegetables/fruit, and 250 grams of green beans, exchanged for e-Warung which has been provided by the Social Service Bogor Regency. Data collection through questionnaires and observation of e-Warung 40 respondents was taken based on a purposive random sampling technique. The data was analyzed through validity and reliability tests, as well as a hypothesis test in measuring the level of satisfaction of residents with BPNT through e-Warung in Cibinong. The results of the study provide clues that several dimensions of the level of satisfaction that affect the distribution of current BPNT in the Cibinong sub-district, namely: Accuracy in implementation, there are 6 precise aspects: Target, quantity, price, time, quality, and administration. There are two kinds of measurements of Family Welfare Nationally, namely, Measurements by the Central Bureau of Statistics and Measurements carried out by the National Family Planning Coordinating Board, with concerning e-Warung, measurements based on population, health, consumption patterns, and employment. The conclusion is that the level of citizen satisfaction with BPNT has a very positive effect. The results of the study stated that citizen satisfaction increased by 24% on the accuracy of providing assistance and satisfaction increased by 27% on e-Warung performance.

Keywords: Satisfaction, Non-Cash Food Assistance and e-Warung.

I. INTRODUCTION

At a time when the world is experiencing economic changes due to recession everywhere, Indonesia remains in a position that is not so shaken. The habit of the Indonesian people who are always patient in accepting the fact that there are also different perceptions compared to other countries towards changes in the world economy can be neutralized with these characteristics. The basis of the state is very influential for the order of life of the Indonesian nation, where on the other hand there are capitalist countries and on the other hand there are socialist countries. Residents' perceptions of the economy are very large, as well as residents' perceptions of health. This is based on the fact that people don't want a lot of sacrifices in various aspects of life, this pandemic is happening all over the world. So this is not the time to talk about political issues, but to talk about the food crisis dilemma. The capital market analysis said that the implementation of the reverse restrictions by the regional government specifically for the Capital City (DKI) Jakarta was a very negative sentiment for the stock market. Considering that some of these policies greatly affected the economy, changed many business and business sector conditions, and many residents experienced termination of employment[1].Even though the turnover of economic activity in Indonesia is mostly in DKI Jakarta. residents are looking for money to improve their standard of living so that the buffer zones of Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang, and Bekasi become a magnet for people throughout Indonesia to make money through economic activities. areas around the Jabodetabek area include Cibinong District, Bogor Regency, and West Java, and continue to experience rapid changes and growth in line with the increasing needs of the population for space and mobility.

The Cibinong area is the border area between DKI Jakarta and West Java, so it is growing rapidly in various fields of activity de, offices and industry, and "commuter line" community settlements. the people who mostly work go to the capital and return to the people's settlements. During the pandemic from a few years ago until now, all components on this earth have experienced changes in their life systems. Starting from those who are used to living every day, they have to find food for that day until in the end they are completely unable to make a living to live that day. However, the good information means that the

Government is delivering social donations in the form of groceries, as well as self-protective health assistance such as vaccinations, face-covering masks, hand sanitizers, hand soap, PPE (Personal Protective Equipment) for health energy (Nakes) and caretakers for sick people Covid19 (Corona virus disease 19) also buried the bodies of victims of the disease who died globally. also, donate the government has made Isoman (self-isolation) an appropriate area for Covid19 sufferers. The government is concerned about the large number of people suffering from Covid19 but the problem is that they are still huddled together in one house with a shared bathroom[2]. but many are comfortable with these terms because they are used to living together in one dwelling. The government has carried out many social donation policies to increase the living level of the people and they are directly accepted by the people.

The Indonesian government's policies include the empowerment program for the poor, namely the Gotong Royong Warung (e-Warung) electronic program. e-Warung program for the welfare of beneficiary families In cash social assistance to non-cash donations, beneficiary residents can develop their businesses through e-Warung, which means the government's efforts to improve the welfare of beneficiary families. This research observes the level of citizen satisfaction with non-cash food assistance through e-Warung from the Government, which number in the trillions and really helps to increase citizen satisfaction or has less influence on changing the requirements of people's awareness of this pandemic. By knowing how much satisfaction is needed, donations raise people's awareness so they can handle the Covid-19 pandemic better. Even though there are still many kinds of people's rejection of excellent donations from the Government of the Republic of Indonesia, there is also not a small number of people acceptance of these donations so cooperation is established between citizens and the government in dealing with Covid19.Satisfaction (life satisfaction) is a mental change about the situation that is felt with a dummy state as an ideal standard for areas of life goals they consider crucial such as: Interpersonal correlations, health, work, income, spirituality, lifestyle, and togetherness. Meanwhile[3], regarding one's surrender in his life and how to fulfill everything he wants is life satisfaction. Satisfaction is comparing a person's assessment of his current living conditions with ideal conditions. The smaller the feeling between what is wanted and what is needed by humans, the greater the satisfaction in one's life.[4], Satisfaction is a cognitive evaluation of how well and satisfying things have been done by individuals in their lives as a whole and in important areas of their lives that are considered important (domain satisfaction) such as interpersonal correlation, health, work, income, spirituality, and leisure activities[5].

Life satisfaction is happiness that comes from fulfilling needs or hopes for causes or means to enjoy[6]. Meanwhile, life satisfaction is general psychological well-being or life satisfaction for very mature people, life satisfaction is related to income, health, an active lifestyle, and a network of togetherness[7]. The level of satisfaction is a person's assessment in a comparison of performance or what will happen with his predictions[8]. Satisfaction is a state of complete fulfillment of customer expectations and needs, evaluated as satisfactory service. Service user customer satisfaction is the level of one's feelings after comparing perceived performance with expectations[9]. This is a form of the satisfaction level of Cibinong residents with the government's non-cash food assistance through e-Warung. To distribute the welfare of the Indonesian people, the government seeks to enhance people's access to food, using programs and stimuli. One stimulus is the distribution of Rastra (Beras Sejahtera), which was previously Raskin. Furthermore, to increase the effectiveness and accuracy of targets and encourage people to access finance easily. The President of the Republic of Indonesia, by Presidential Regulation No. 82 of 2016, namely the National Strategy for Financial Inclusion, stated that the financial management strategy and connecting the public to banking services is an effort to accelerate poverty alleviation. According to the Republic of Indonesia's state secretariat, the results of a closed meeting dated 16 March 2016 regarding the poverty alleviation program for economic inequality, it was agreed that starting in the 2017 fiscal year, the distribution of Raskin benefits (later called Non-Cash Food Assistance/BPNT) uses non-cash e-Voucher technology, so that it is right on target. and easier to serve.

Non-cash food assistance is food social assistance in non-cash form from the government given to family beneficiaries every month through an electronic account mechanism that is used only to buy food at e-Warung traders who work with banks. The implementation of the 2017 BPNT Program is a pilot project

design and if the implementation is correct and effective it will be continued in the following year and at the same time as an effort to transform the policy from the Rastra pattern to BPNT nationally. Minister of Social Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia No. 20 of 2019 concerning the distribution of BPNT (non-cash food assistance). The general provisions are as follows: Social assistance is assistance in the amount of money, goods, or services to a person, family, group, or community who cannot afford it. And to help prosper the family, they are given hope with non-cash food social assistance in exchange for staple foods. This research method uses descriptive qualitative and quantitative methods, which seek to find basic answers by analyzing the dimensions of satisfaction. Primary data collection and also interviews by asking directly the stakeholders in Cibinong District and also the people who enjoy social assistance and health assistance. After that, it is calculated quantitatively what percentage of the people receive it and what percentage of the people still refuse or are not responsive to government assistance. The government has carried out various social assistance programs for people impacted by Covid19. The following are various aids and financial subsidies disbursed by the government during the 6 months of the pandemic: (1). Groceries assistance. Food packages are one of the assistance provided by the government in the early days of the Covid-19 pandemic.

(2) Direct cash assistance, (3) BLT village funds, (4) Electricity tariff incentives, (5) Pre-Employment Cards, (6) Employee Salary Subsidies, (7) BLT UMKM, (8) Free credit and quota assistance Stated that the various assistance and subsidies disbursed by the government were not effective in boosting the Indonesian economy, this was due to 3 things. First, low-income people increased during the pandemic. Second, people experience a decline in purchasing power. The lower class no longer can buy, while the upper middle class reduces the amount of consumption. Third, the pattern of assistance which tends to be discontinuous. According to the President, Government Cash Assistance is assistance in the form of cash to residents. Non-Cash Food Assistance is a government program[10]. A program is a policy instrument that contains one or more activities carried out by government agencies or institutions to achieve goals or objectives to obtain budget allocations for community activities coordinated by community agencies. Meanwhile, non-cash food assistance is food assistance in non-cash from the government which is given to beneficiary families every month through a special electronic account mechanism to buy food at food grocers or e-Warungs in collaboration with a bank. The allocation of non-cash food assistance or basic food cards must be targeted to beneficiary families, the amount according to the data of people who need assistance in each region[11]. Community welfare is prosperity, happiness, and quality of human life both at the level of individuals or groups of families and communities. Poverty is the main problem faced by developing countries, especially Indonesia.

The number of poor people in September 2021 data has decreased (12.53%) or around 11.86 million people, compared to March 2021, which was 13.10 percent or around 12.18 million people[10]. The poverty reduction occurred because of the large number of social assistance distributed to the poor by the government. The government wants to be free from the burden of the poor, namely by establishing a poverty alleviation program as an effort to make people prosperous and improve their standard of living. Economic equality in certain areas requires government intervention so that people rise from poverty and achieve prosperity. Without government assistance, the poor will not be able to get up and will not be able to get a decent share of the national development income. Because welfare is the essence of national development which reflects the quality of life of a family and is expected to improve the standard of living. Social welfare can be achieved according to the increasing standard of living of the community. Prosperity is freedom from poverty or distractions, difficulties in life, and worries so that you feel safe both physically and mentally[15]. The existing program has been implemented since 2016 through Family Welfare Card data so that BPNT disbursements are carried out at e-Warung. BPNT is given in the form of a Bank Mandiri Balance card of IDR 200,000 and can only be exchanged for Food Ingredients at e-Warung, in the form of Rice and Eggs which are most needed as Commodities most needed by beneficiary Families. The goal is to equitably fulfill food needs for low-income communities.

Distribution of this assistance is given every month as much as 10 Kg of Rice, and 1 Kg of Eggs for each BPNT recipient according to government policy. The e-Warung program is a collaboration carried out by the Ministry of Social Affairs or at the Social Service level with Himbara Bank (Association of State Banks, namely BRI, BTN, Mandiri, and BNI with the Social Assistance system.Meanwhile, the provision of staple goods is in collaboration with BULOG (Logistics Agency) Cooperatives and PD Tohaga Market Ministry of Social Affairs cooperates with social assistants and Joint Business Group whose members are beneficiaries. The establishment of e-Warung aims to improve the welfare of families receiving social assistance. Also, BPNT beneficiary communities are greatly assisted as beneficiary families by fulfilling the needs of balanced nutritional food for beneficiaries. The weaknesses and several problems in the E-Warung program, namely: First, the readiness of e-Warung is still uneven in several regions. Second, regarding the data on recipients of BPNT assistance from the Ministry of Social Affairs that was sent to the banking sector which still needs to be validated, in fact, the Bank no longer needs to re-validate the data provided by the Ministry of Social Affairs, but in reality, the Bank has to re-collect data received from the Ministry of Social Affairs because there are many differences in data in the field. Third, registration with the managing bank is still not effective, because there are still many poor people who still have difficulty registering the program with the program executing bank.

Formulation Of The Problem

Government assistance, according to the President, is assistance in the form of non-cash in the form of food, in the form of food, pulses, and others, while cash assistance to residents is in the form of money through Himbara Bank. Formulation of the problem: How is the effectiveness of the assistance program through non-cash food e-Warung with the accuracy of targeting, quantity, time, price, quality, and administration through Electronic stalls in increasing the satisfaction of the people of Cibinong District

Research Purposes

The purpose of establishing an e-Warung is to increase the convenience for social beneficiary families to receive assistance. also for the people who receive BPNT, conditions will be achieved by meeting the need for balanced nutritional food for beneficiaries. The purpose of this research is to find out how the satisfaction of people's acceptance of non-cash food assistance through e-Warung in Cibinong. Formulation of the problem: (1) How positive is the significant level of people's satisfaction with government BPNT assistance through the community e-Warung in Cibinong (2) How positive is the government BPNT's significant impact on the needs of the Cibinong community? To find out the satisfaction of the community members regarding the effectiveness of targeting, quantity, price, time, quality, and administration based on population and education, health and family planning, consumption patterns, and employment through the Electronic Warung program in Cibinong District.

II. METHODS

This research method seeks to find basic answers by analyzing the dimensions of satisfaction. The survey was conducted to obtain primary data as well as interviews by asking directly the officials in Cibinong District and also the people who enjoy social assistance and health assistance. After that it is calculated quantitatively, what percentage of the people receive it and what percentage of the people still refuse or are not responsive to the government assistance[14]. Observation through descriptive qualitative and qualitative analysis methods. The analysis was carried out based on primary data with a total of 40 respondents with purposive random sampling, determined through a survey and calculating the Likert scale obtained in the field regarding assessment and beneficiary families, then analyzing the questionnaire answers. As a benchmark in the assessment of each aspect are the rules and provisions in the General Guidelines for Distribution of Rastra and BPNT. So that the policy is considered a good program or not. Respondent achievement level (TCR) = Mean/5. The satisfaction of Cibinong residents is the dependent variable whose expectations are useful, satisfying, and sustainable. Target accuracy, quantity, price, time, quality, and administration are the first independent variables, and population, education, health and family planning, consumption patterns, and employment are the second independent variables. The Likert scale is 5 levels starting from value 1 is strongly disagree, value 2 disagrees, value 3 is doubtful, value 4 is agreed, value 5 strongly agree

The analysis technique uses SPSS 24, and the data is tabulated and processed through several tests:

- 1. Validity test
- 2. Reliability Test
- 3. Normality Test
- 4. Multicollinearity Test
- 5. Heteroscedasticity Test

The testing technique is to calculate whether the data can be tested to a linear regression test. The use of qualitative data analysis is to describe the responses of the respondents. Meanwhile, to obtain unique items of research variables by calculating the central value (mean, median, mode), standard deviation values , and the coefficient of variation.

Quantitative analysis with regression analysis

Y = Satisfaction

a = constant

X1 = Accuracy, X2 = Distribution via e-Warung, b = regression coefficient, e = standard error

A regression is said to be linear if it satisfies the linearity requirements, such as data normality, free from classical statistical assumptions. Thus forming an equation model:

 $\mathbf{Y} = \mathbf{a} + \mathbf{b}\mathbf{1}\mathbf{X}\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{b}\mathbf{2}\mathbf{X}\mathbf{2} + \mathbf{e}$

Testing the hypothesis with statistics, consisting of (1). Determination Coefficient Test (2). Simultaneous test (3) F-test (4) Partial test (5) T-test after calculating the regression analysis.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Respondents who filled out questionnaires from the 45 units offered, managed to collect as many as 40 respondents. Respondent Satisfaction Level reached 87.5%. The results of the loading factor are greater than the KMO value, namely 0.6, with a significance of 0.00 <0.05. This achievement is very high to continue further analysis.

Validity Test And Reliability Test

Validity is a measure that shows the validity or validity of an instrument. Experts say that the Validity Test refers to how the instrument performs its function. So that the truth can only be obtained with a valid instrument. SPSS24 collects data from respondents and provides validity test results as shown in Table 1 below:

Variable K could Description				
Variable	R hitung	Recommended		
Satisfaction: -Useful	0.082	Valid		
-According to expectations	0.915	Valid		
-Sustainable	0.906	Valid		
Accuracy: - Target	0.920	Valid		
-Amount	0.900	Valid		
-Time	0.926	Valid		
-Price	0.891	Valid		
-Quality	0.835	Valid		
-Administration	0.897	Valid		
Dealer:- Resident	0.887	Valid		
-Health	0.864	Valid		
-Consumption Pattern	0.935	Valid		
-Employment	0.905	Valid		

Table 1.	Validity	Test	Results
Variable	R count	Desc	rintion

r $_{0.05}$ table, n-2 = 40-2 = 38 is 0.320, the test is declared valid if r count> r table

Based on the calculation of the validity test, each of the questions posed to the respondents all values above the r0.05 table, which is above 0.320. The accuracy of the target and quantity, price, quality of distribution, timeliness, correct administration, and condition of the e-Warung with the suitability of citizen data based on population records, health, consumption patterns, and employment can be said to give satisfaction to local residents.

Reliability Test

The reliability test is a tool to measure each question in the questionnaire and whether the answer to the question from the respondent is stable and consistent at all times. The reliability test refers to the Alpha value, the basis for decision making, and the reliability test are: If the Cronbach Alpha value is > 0.7, the questionnaire is declared reliable. On the other hand, if the Cronbach Alpha <0.7, the question is less reliable. Test the reliability of each question in the independent and dependent variables. The Cronbach alpha values of the three variables are in Table 2 below:

Variable Value Cronbach alpha			
Variable	Value Cronbach Alpha		
Y (Bound Variable)	0.884		
X1	0.948		
X2	0.919		

The test results of this study are reliable because the Cronbach Alpha value is > 0.7, meaning that the 2 independent variables measured based on the indicators are valid and reliable.

Normality Test

 Table 3. The non-parametric one-sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov

test states that all variables are normal.

Y 0.05 0.187 Normal	Explanation	Asymp(two-tailed)	Alpha	Variable
N1 0.05 0.202 N1 1	Normal	0.187	0.05	Y
XI 0.05 0.383 Normal	Normal	0.383	0.05	X1
X2 0.05 0.363 Normal	Normal	0.363	0.05	X2

Multicollinearity Test

Multicollinearity test to see the correlation between the independent variables in the regression model. The regression model with multicollinearity independent regression is a variable with a VIF (Variance Influence Factor) value of less than 10. The variables of citizen satisfaction, the accuracy of the provision, and the condition of the e-Warung have met the Multicollinearity test.

Heteroscedasticity Test

The heteroscedasticity test shows that the pattern has an independent point. Based on the test, it can be seen that the points have a spread pattern, so there is no heteroscedasticity in this regression. Based on the answers from the respondents to each question, the comparison with the Studentized Delete residual, the regression value is the homoscedasticity model.

Linear Regression Test

The regression equation model shows the relationship between the effect of the dependent variable on the independent variable. According to this analysis, it meets the requirements of linearity. The data met the Normality requirements and were free from classical statistical assumptions because they had tested the normality of multicollinearity data and heteroscedasticity with normal results and were free from classical assumptions. This regression equation also shows the results of hypothesis testing in the form of a statistical test or t-test to see the significant effect of the dependent variable on the independent variable partially. Data processing obtains a summary of the test results in Table 4.

Independent Variable	Coefficient Regression	t	Sig	α	Description
Content:	2.209	2.489	0.000	0.05	
X1	0.240	2.117	0.000	0,05	
X2	0.269	1.538	0.000	0.05	
F	45.927		0.000	0.05	
R Square				0.781	
R2 Adjusted				0.759	

Model Feasibility Test

To find out that the independent variables that have been determined are appropriate variables to explain the occurrence of variations in the dependent variable, a model feasibility test is needed, with the F test or ANOVA. The F value = 65,927 is significant 0.00 <0.05 so the marketing, support, and organization variables are appropriate variables to explain the variable (Satisfaction).

So that a regression equation formula is made:

Y = 2.209 + 0.240X1 + 0.269X2 + e

Next is the Hypothesis Test

Hypothesis testing consists of:

(1) Test the coefficient of determination (Test R2),

(2) Simultaneous Test

(3) F-test

(4) Partial Test

(5) Test t-test

After doing regression and creating a regression formula, the hypothesis will be tested:

1. Citizen satisfaction with non-cash social assistance, the regression coefficient is 2,209 with a t value of 2,487, t is > a significance value of 0.00 <0.05, conclusion: Variable Accuracy in distributing social assistance has a positive and significant influence on competitive strategy, Ha is accepted Ho was rejected. This variable of accuracy in distributing social assistance has a positive and significant influence on the satisfaction of Cibinong residents.

2. Residents' satisfaction with non-cash social assistance via e-Warung, with a regression coefficient value of 0.24 > 0.05, with a t value of 2.117 > from a significance value of 0.00 < 0.05, conclusion: The distribution variable via e-warung has a positive influence and not significant to the satisfaction of Cibinong residents.

3. Citizen satisfaction with non-cash social assistance via e-Warung, with a regression coefficient value of 0.269 > 0.05, with a t value of 1.538 > with a significance value of > 0.05, conclusion: The distribution variable via e-warung has a positive effect but not significant on the satisfaction of Cibinong residents.

Coefficient of Determination

Determination analysis or R is adjusted to find out how much the ability of the dependent variable to explain the independent variable is. The R2 value is between 0 > R2 < 1. The R square value resulting from the fulfilled variable is 0.759. The R2 value is used to analyze the model's ability to explain the dependent variable due to the limitations of the R2 value in presenting the actual effective value where the value always increases as the independent variable increases. Adjusted R-Square value is 0.781 dependent variable. Citizen satisfaction is explained by the independent variable distribution accuracy and e-Warung, the remaining variables are used outside. The hypothesis test resulted in the accuracy of the distribution of non-cash social assistance which had a significant positive effect on the satisfaction of Cibinong residents, Bogor district with a t value of 2.117 > 0.05. If the regression coefficient of 1% accuracy increases citizen satisfaction by 24%. Meanwhile, the regression coefficient for the accuracy of 1% distribution of social assistance through e-Warung increases citizen satisfaction by 26.9%.

IV. CONCLUSION

The results of the study show that people are satisfied with the acceptance of non-cash food assistance through e-Warung in Cibinong. The conclusion is that the level of citizen satisfaction is useful, according to expectations, and is sustainable with non-cash food assistance which has a very positive effect. The results of the study stated that citizen satisfaction increased by 24% on the accuracy of providing assistance and satisfaction increased by 27% on e-Warung performance. The accuracy of targeting, quantity, time, price, quality, and administration based on population, health, consumption patterns, and employment in the distribution significantly increased citizen satisfaction with government non-cash assistance through community e-Warung in Cibinong.

V. ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The regional government of Bogor district gives attention that citizens' satisfaction with government assistance has increased during the restrictions in Indonesia. It is suggested to provide better services to less fortunate citizens and reduce poverty. Citizen satisfaction affects the economic life in Indonesia. Residents are helped and try to live a better life from social welfare

REFERENCES

- Alisjahbana, Armida., S., Chris Manning, Survey of Recent Development, Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Student, Vol.38, No.3,2002:277-305
- [2] Cheshmehzangi, Ali, Housing and Health evaluation related to general comfort and indoor thermal comfort satisfaction during the COVID-19 lockdown. *Journal of Human Behavior in The SocialEnvironment*, Volume 31, 2021 – issue 1-4
- [3] Frisch. 2006. Psychiatric Mental Health Nursing. Thomson Delmar Learning, Canada
- [4] Diener. 2008. Happiness Unlocking The Mysteries Of Psychological Wealth. Blackwell Publishing, Singapore
- [5] Hurlock. 2004. Developmental Psychology. Erlangga. Jakarta
- [6] Kotler and Keller, 2016. Marketing Management. Prentice Hall. New Jersey
- [7] Tjiptono, F. 2001. Business Strategy. Andi. Yogyakarta.
- [8] Pusdatin. 2021. Indonesian Data Center. Pusdatin Publisher. Jakarta
- [9] Pramesti, I.P., Utaminingsih, A, dan Rahayu, R.K., 2018 Implementasi Program E-Warong Kube
- [10] Srikandi di Kota Malang (Kelurahan Bareng, Kecamatan Klojen). Jurnal Mahasiswa dan Pemerintahan 3(2016), 23-35
- [11] Widianto, Bambang. Kontan.co.id . Monday, 12 February 2019 10:35WIB. Gramedia. Jakarta
- [12] Rivai et al. 2008. Appropriate Performance Appraisal System for Assessing Employee Performance and Increasing Company Competitiveness. Edition 3, Raja Grafindo. Jakarta
- [13] Harahap, et, all, Macrozoobenthos diversity as anbioindicator of the water quality in the Sungai Kualuh Labuhanbatu Utara, AACL Bioflux, 2022, Vol 15, Issue 6.
- [14] State Secretariat, 2021. Press, Media, and Information Bureau of the Presidential Secretariat, Jl. Veterans No. 16, Central Jakarta, Postal Code 10110
- [15] Toikko, Timo & Teemu Rantanen. How does the welfare state model influence social and political attitudes? An analysis of Citizens" concrete and abstract attitude toward poverty. *Journal of International and Comparative Social Policy*, Volume 33,2017- issure3.
- [16] Harahap, P.Hrp, N.K.A.R.Dewi, Macrozoobenthos diversity as anbioindicator of the water quality in the River Kualuh Labuhanbatu Utara, *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 9(4), 2020, pp.179-183.
- [17] Manolitzas, Panagiotis & Denis Yannacopoulos. Citizen Satisfaction: A Multicriteria Satisfaction analysis. *International Journal of Public Administration*, Volume 36, 2013-issue 9.